COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY FAYETTE CIRCUIT COURT FOURTH DIVISION

HAYNES PROPERTIES, LLC, et al.

v.

ATTEST, VINCENT RIGGS, CLERAP LAINTIFFS

AUG 24 2021

CONTROL CLERK

DEPUTY

DEFENDANTS

BURLEY TOBACCO GROWERS COOPERATIVE ASSOCIATION, et al.

ORDER

The above-styled matter came before the Court on August 20, 2021, on the Motion to Alter, Amend, or Vacate by Intervening Defendants/Objectors Roger Quarles, et al. Class Counsel pointed out in their Response that CR 59.05 makes no allowance for the filing of successive CR 59.05 motions, and there is no authority for allowing a party to make more than one such motion. It appears that the Quarles Objectors may have already filed a CR 59.05 motion in the form of their Motion to Refer the Parties to Mediation. Though not styled as a Motion to Alter, Amend, or Vacate, there would be no need for a mediation on the terms of the judgment if the Quarles Objectors had no intent to change the terms upon which the Court had already ruled. Despite this, however, the Court allowed all Parties to make their arguments on the Record, as it seemed disingenuous to the Court to make the argument against successive attempts to change the final judgment when multiple Parties attempted to do the same in their responses.

The issue of whether the Quarles Objectors made successive motions does not need to be addressed, however, if they are unable to meet the burden of CR 59.05. The Kentucky Supreme Court has stated that while "CR 59.05 does not set forth the grounds for the motion" courts have nonetheless limited its use "because 'reconsideration of a judgment after its entry is an extraordinary remedy which should be used sparingly." *Gullion v. Gullion*, 163 S.W.3d 888, 893 (Ky. 2005) (*quoting* FEDERAL PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE § 2810.1).

Having reviewed the Record, relevant case law, and memorandums of parties, as well as having heard the arguments of counsel, this Court HEREBY DENIES the motion as the Quarles objectors have not cleared the high bar for setting aside a judgment after its entry.

Given under my hand this $\underline{\mathcal{AY}}$

_day-of August 2021.

HÓN. JULIE MUTH GOODMAN

JUDGE, FAYETTE CIRCUIT COURT

CLERK'S CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing has been served on this _____ day of August, 2021, via U.S. Mail, first class, to the following:

AUG 2 4 2021

Katherine K. Yunker Jason R. Hollon McBrayer PLLC 201 E. Main Street, Suite 900 Lexington, KY 40507-1361 Settlement Class Counsel

Jeremy S. Rogers
Dinsmore & Shohl LLP
101 South Fifth Street, Suite 2500
Louisville, KY 40202
jeremy.rogers@dinsmore.com
Counsel for Defendant Burley Tobacco
Growers Cooperative Association

Kevin G. Henry
Charles D. Cole
Sturgill, Turner, Barker & Maloney
PLLC
333 West Vine Street, Suite 1500
Lexington, KY 40507
khenry@sturgillturner.com
ccole@sturgillturner.com
Counsel for Defendant Burley Tobacco
Growers Cooperative Association

John N. Billings
Christopher L. Thacker
Richard J. Dieffenbach
Billings Law Firm, PLLC
145 Constitution Street
Lexington, KY 40507
nbillings@blfky.com
cthacker@blfky.com
rich.dieffenbach@blfky.com
Counsel for Defendant Greg Craddock on
behalf of himself and all others similarly
situated

W. Henry Graddy, IV 137 North Main St. Versailles, KY 40383 Counsel for Objector Roger Quarles

David Tachau
101 S. Fifth St., Ste. 3600
PNC Tower
Louisville, KY 40202-3120
(502) 238-9900
dtachau@tachaulaw.com
Counsel for Billings Law Firm, PLLC

Fayette Circuit Court Clerk